SUPPLEMENT

The Seder Ritual Committee

In the early 1950’s Jewish organizations in the United States were grappling with the problem of finding proper responses to the horrors of the Holocaust. One proposal put forth involved composing a prayer in memory of the victims of the Holocaust to be recited as part of the Seder service. The initial backing for the project both financially and institutionally came from the American Jewish Congress. A committee was formed that became known as the Seder Ritual Committee with Rufus Learsi (Israel Goldberg), a historian, serving as its chairman. By 1953, the committee had composed a prayer to be recited after the pouring of the fourth cup of wine during the Seder and just before the door was opened to symbolically invite Eliyahu Ha’Navi to enter. It was given the name: Seder Ritual Of Remembrance (Exhibit “1”). Copies of the Ritual containing both the Hebrew text and its English translation were distributed through Jewish organizations and synagogues. The Ritual concluded by calling for those present to sing the song of Ani Ma’Amin.

The original records of the Committee’s activities are available for review at the American Jewish Historical Society, located within the Center for Jewish History at 15 West 16th Street in Manhattan. The records indicate that the Committee undertook a massive publicity campaign to encourage the adoption of the Ritual as part of the Seder. A substantial number of Jewish newspapers, including both those of the Anglo-Jewish press and the Yiddish press, ran articles publicizing the program while including the full text of the prayer. Many Jewish organizations did likewise in their newsletters. A large sample of articles and newsletters are available for review within the Committee’s records.

In the pre-copy machine era in which the Committee was working, the process of distributing copies of the Ritual was left to the Committee. Organizations would submit orders and the Committee would requisition copies from a printer. The copies would then be bundled and shipped to each organization. A memo dated May 26, 1958 indicated that in the previous three years, 266 synagogues, temples and Hillel groups ordered and paid for 44,235 copies of the Ritual.

The committee worked diligently for over 15 years, from 1953 to 1968, to encourage the public to adopt the Ritual. Each year they sought to enlist new groups to publicize their program. Sadly, the last record found in the Committee’s file dates from 1968. From the correspondence written in 1968, it was evident that the death of its chairman, Rufus Learsi, in 1964, slowly brought the program to a halt.

Today, few know of the work of the Seder Ritual Committee or recite the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance. I was born in 1953 and do not remember my parents, both Holocaust survivors living in Boston, ever including such a prayer in our Seder service. My father, a’h,
while leading the Seder, always recalled his personal experiences during the Holocaust particularly when he reached the paragraph in the Haggadah that began: V’Hi Sh’Amda. He did not dwell on the magnitude of the tragedy as much as he expressed his thanks to G-d for having spared him.

That the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance is now only a footnote in the history of the Seder liturgy and never became incorporated as part of the standard Seder ritual can be traced to the fact that few if any printed Haggadahs ever included the prayer. The Committee’s records demonstrated that little effort was made to solicit publishers of Hebrew books to include the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance in the updated editions of their Haggadahs. The study of the history of Jewish liturgy demonstrates that the decision as to what text becomes standard in Jewish liturgy lies very much in the hands of book publishers and before them, book copyists. They control what enters and what is excised from Jewish prayer books while being mindful of the demands of their consuming public. It is clear that in the case of the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance the public did not demand that publishers include the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance within their Haggadahs and without a significant push from the Committee, the book publishers had no incentive to include the Ritual within their updated editions of the Haggadah.

That said, the records of the Committee revealed two points in its history when book publishers opened discussions with the committee about including the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance into their updated editions of their Haggadahs. In August 1962, the Committee contacted Dr. Philip Birnbaum who had edited editions of the weekday, Sabbath and Holiday prayer books and the prayer books for the High Holidays. Dr. Birnbaum indicated that he expected to edit a new edition of the Haggadah and was anxious to include a memorial prayer to the victims of the Holocaust in it. In his correspondence, Dr. Birnbaum expressed reservations about certain aspects of both the Hebrew text and the English translation contained within the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance. The handwritten correspondence between Dr. Birnbaum and Rufus Learsi was somewhat difficult to read but it was evident that Learsi had no interest in changing either the English or the Hebrew text. As a result, the discussions between Dr. Birnbaum and the committee ended without an agreement. It would be unfair to blame either side for the impasse. By 1962, the Committee had distributed several hundred thousand copies of the prayer. To change the wording of the prayer at that point would have tainted what had already been distributed. Dr. Birnbaum could not be faulted as well. He did not want to give his stamp of approval to a prayer that did not meet his textual standards.

A second attempt to include the Ritual in a printed Haggadah took place in 1964. The Hebrew Book Publishing Company contacted Dr. Joachim Prinz, President of the American Jewish Congress. It requested permission to include the Ritual in its next edition of the Haggadah. Dr. Prinz gave his consent but hesitated to make his consent final without first obtaining the agreement of his full board of directors. Due to an illness that overtook Dr. Prinz, he did not have the opportunity to submit the request for a vote. From the records, it
appears that the Seder Ritual Committee was unaware that the Hebrew Book Publishing Company made the request of Dr. Prinz and it further appears that the Hebrew Book Publishing Company did not know that its offer had not been submitted to the board due to Dr. Prinz’s illness. Several follow-up requests were made by the Hebrew Book Publishing Company. In its final communication, the Company indicated that because it was nearing its deadline to print, it would seek an alternate memorial text that had been offered to it by the Prayer Book Press of Hartford.

One last obstacle stood in the way of the Committee obtaining widespread support for the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance; the failure of the committee to obtain the endorsement of any major Orthodox Jewish organizations. Individual Orthodox Rabbis did join the committee. At one point four Orthodox Rabbis were listed on the committee’s letterhead: Rabbis Joseph Lookstein, z”l, Emanuel Rackman, z”l, Simon G. Kramer, z”l and Philip Goodman, z”l. Of that group, only a letter from Rabbi Joseph Lookstein remains as a record of his endorsement. He told of including the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance as part of his Seder service and that the Ritual had been well received by the guests who attended his Seder.

The Committee’s records do indicate that several Orthodox organizations ordered copies of the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance. Yeshiva University and the Rabbinical Council of America were among those organizations.

In 1962 an effort was made by the committee to obtain the endorsement of the Union of Orthodox Jewish Congregations. In a letter dated December 7, 1962 Rabbi Samson R. Weiss, z”l, President of the Union answered on Union stationery but indicated that he was speaking for himself and not as Executive Vice-President of the Union. He chose his words carefully but undoubtedly expressed the opinion of most Orthodox organizations on the question of whether to include the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance in the Seder service:

The Haggadah, though, which dates back in its major parts to Tannaitic times has not changed for centuries. Even the terrible tragedies of the “Gezoroth Tach V’Tat” were not given remembrance in the Haggadah which is exclusively consecrated to our redemption from Egypt and by the recital of which we fulfill the divine precept of telling its story to our children. The great national tragedies are remembered in the Kinoth recited on the 9th of Ab. Recently, special Kinoth in commemoration of our six million brethren were circulated.

With the exception of the Yizkor prayer (or the hashkavah in the Sephardic synagogues), our Yom Tov ritual has been designed by our Sages and their successors to accentuate the Jewish joy and not the Jewish sorrow. The Haggadah likewise reflects this tendency. Unless the inclusion of your Ritual of Remembrance were advocated by the recognized Torah authorities of our age, here and in Israel, I do not see my way clear in joining your committee.
The last records found in the Committees’ files date from 1968. It is not evident from the Committee’s records what precipitated the work of the Committee to cease. Financial support for the Committee initially came from the American Jewish Congress. Several years prior to the Committee disbanding, the organization withdrew its financial support. In the years after, the financial deficit of the committee was underwritten by one individual, Sundel Doniger, inventor of the Exacto knife.

I cannot state with certainty that the failure of the Committee to obtain the endorsement of any major Orthodox Jewish organizations doomed the work of the Committee. A review of tens of Haggadahs that have been published since 1953 yielded only one Haggadah which included any references to the Holocaust. Rabbi Menachem Kasher, z”l, in two editions of his Israel Passover Haggadah, included a prayer and three illustrations; a painting depicting a Seder during the time of the Inquisition, a picture of the entrance to the concentration camp at Auschwitz and a picture of the concentration camp at Treblinka. The prayer is annexed hereto as Exhibit “2”.

Given the reluctance of the Orthodox Jewish Rabbinate to include a memorial prayer for Holocaust victims in the Seder service, it is fair to ask: what place, if any, does Jewish martyrdom have in Jewish liturgy? Let us begin by identifying where within the regular liturgy we find the theme of Jewish martyrdom. On שבת, we find the theme of martyrdom within the אב הרחים美味 prayer that we recite before we return the Torah scroll to the ark which takes place before we recite התפלה מוסק.

אב הרחים, שומך מרחים, ברחים וע지요ים, להם יפקרה ברחים, והדרים והישרים והרמימים, קרלאת הדך שלמוסר נפשו על קזרת חום. ... יוכר בלא-לוהינו לפורדם, עם שאר צדיקי עולם, ונכוס לציון נכמים, ובצורי החשך.

Translation: Father of compassion, who dwells on high: may He remember in His compassion the pious, the upright and the blameless-boly communities who sacrificed their lives for the sanctification of G-d’s name . . . O our G-d, remember them for good with the other righteous of the world and may He exact retribution for the shed blood of His servants1.

In the יום ייבר service that is held on four holidays each year, many congregations add a special מעלה אבר המלחין prayer and on behalf of the victims of the Holocaust and the victims of other tragedies in Jewish history. We include קינות, elegies, on Tisha B’Av in which we recall several several great tragedies that befell the Jewish people including the Crusades and the Holocaust. Lastly, we remember the אלוהי הקדושים, the Ten Martyrs, in the התפלה מוסק prayer that we recite on Yom Kippur during the repetition of Shemona Esrei in just before we recite יודוי, confession.

Perhaps it is in the אלוהי אבר המלחין prayer that we find a clue to the Halachic problem that arises

1. Koren Siddur page 528.
when we include references to Jewish martyrdom within Jewish prayer. Let us look carefully at the following lines of that prayer:

Seraphim, in the heights of heaven, called in anguish

"This is then the Law, and this the reward thereof

O You who spreads out light as a garment

Thus the foe blasphemes Your great and awesome Name

And scorns Your Law.

Out of Heaven a voice replied

Let no sound more be uttered,

Lest I turn the world to water,

And My throne's footstool to sudden chaos.

This is My decree;

Accept it, all of you who love the Law

Which I created when the world was made.

From this liturgical piece we can conclude that we are categorically prohibited from questioning G-d’s actions concerning any of the tragedies that have befallen the Jewish people during their history. The answer will always be the same: it is a decree that I have issued. As a result of this rule, we never find the word: لماذا, Why? in any examples of liturgical pieces that contain the theme of martyrdom. However, on one day of the year, we find do the word: למה in our prayers. That day is אידשת זייד, Yom Kippur. G-d granted us permission to add that word to our prayers on אידשת זייד. He communicated His consent through the prophetic message of יִשְׁרֵי אֲדֻנָּי, who included the word: למה in the words of majestic אֲדֻנָּי אֲדֻנָּי. There we find the verse:

אֲדֻנָּי אֲדֻנָּי אֲדֻנָּי אֲדֻנָּי אֲדֻנָּי אֲדֻנָּי

Translation: Why do you ignore us eternally, forsake us for so long.

This serves as our model for the קنية that we recite on Yom Kippur: וַיְשַׁעַם בָּאָמָּה המילהDEM amalgam LEAM. Since DEM amalgam LEAM included the word: למה in our קنية, we may include the theme of: למה in our קنية. In one such קنية, the word: למה plays a central role:

Artscroll Kinah No. 12

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to be plundered at the hands of plunderers and You have acted like a shepherd who instead of taking action, simply mourned the loss of his flock.

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to be slashed to pieces by tormentors and You acted like a bird wandering aimlessly on the roof;
Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to be stripped bare by the uncircumcised and You have acted like one of the enemies of the Jewish people;

למה לנזת המנד ממ בד מורים וחוזות עם בן זונות לא יהלום

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to be held contemptuous in the eyes of rebels and You have become like a warrior who has lost his power to fight;

למה לנזת יד רבי יהודיו החוזות עם חמ בהל

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to become dishonored by the arrogant and You have become like a bird that flies aimlessly;

למה לנזת נה יד רבי יהודיו חותם יזא חווד

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to be forsaken forever in the hands of aliens and You have become like a brave soldier who flees from battle;

למה לנזת הה לב רבי יהודיו חותם יבר באור

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to be placed into the hands of the blood thirsty and You have become like a stranger in the land of Israel;

למה לנזת אשל לב א$i החותם יא$רה במלים

Why have You allowed the Beis Hamikdash to become darkened in the hands of the cursed and You have acted towards Israel like a transient in a hotel.

The composer of the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance was quite aware of the theological issues that arise when we refer to acts of martyrdom in Jewish liturgy. He acknowledged the problem in the following words:

ואם יזחך למסר בד מעלהים עם חלך אמא ל$והי אנ$ויה ובג$ם א$מנ

But we abstain from dwelling on the deeds of the evil ones lest we defame the image of G-d in which man was created.

All who believe that G-d created mankind also believe that G-d instilled within mankind G-d like characteristics. That means that even the most evil of men carries within him a reflection of G-d. Condemning any man is then tantamount to condemning his Creator.

Let us conclude, therefore, that Rabbi Samson Weiss cannot be faulted for failing to endorse the inclusion of the Seder Ritual Of Remembrance in the Seder service based on his understanding of Halachic principles. Yet by failing to offer an alternative, he and the heads of other Orthodox organizations left themselves open to the criticism that they were being insensitive to the needs of the survivors of the Holocaust. Did the survivors not deserve to receive formal recognition from their religious leaders that they were examples of Jewish people who were once enslaved and then rescued? And was not the Seder service an appropriate moment to do so? Perhaps the difficulty we have in discussing the Holocaust is that we focus our entire attention on those who perished. Is there nothing to say about those who survived? As a child of Holocaust survivors, it is my religious duty to thank G-d for having rescued my parents. I would not be writing these words had G-d not done so.

Perhaps the lesson of the Haggadah is that although tragedies involving the Jewish people will always be a part of world history, so too is G-d’s promise to our forefathers that the Jewish People as a nation will survive each and every episode and will flourish again.
Seder Ritual of Remembrance

FOR THE SIX MILLION JEWS WHO PERISHED AT THE HANDS OF THE NAZIS
AND FOR THE HEROES OF THE GHETTO UPRISINGS

Perform this Ritual
after the THIRD of the Four Ceremonial Cups,
just before the door is opened
for the symbolic entrance of the Prophet Elijah.

All rise,
and the leader of the Seder recites the following:

English rendition of the Hebrew:

On this night of the Seder we remember with reverence and love the six millions of our people of the European exile who perished at the hands of a tyrant more wicked than the Pharaoh who enslaved our fathers in Egypt. Come, said he to his minions, let us cut them off from being a people, that the name of Israel may be remembered no more. And they slew the blameless and pure, men and women and little ones, with vapors of poison and burned them with fire. But we abstain from dwelling on the deeds of the evil ones lest we defame the image of God in which man was created.

Now, the remnants of our people who were left in the ghettos and camps of annihilation rose up against the wicked ones for the sanctification of the Name, and slew many of them before they died. On the first day of Passover the remnants in the Ghetto of Warsaw rose up against the adversary, even as in the days of Judah the Maccabees. They were lovely and pleasant in their lives, and in their death they were not divided, and they brought redemption to the name of Israel through all the world.

And from the depths of their affliction the martyrs lifted their voices in a song of faith in the coming of the Messiah, when justice and brotherhood will reign among men.

All sing ANI MAAMIN (“I Believe”),
the song of the martyrs in the ghettos and liquidation camps:

I believe with perfect faith in the coming of the Messiah:
And though he tarry, none the less do I believe!

ANI MAAMIN
(“I Believe”)

A-ni ma-a-min be-e-mu-no sh’le-mo
B’vi-as ha-mo-shi-ah, v’af al pi
She-yis-ma-ney-ha, im kol ze a-ni ma-a-min.

Issued by
SEDER RITUAL COMMITTEE
15 East 84 Street : New York 20, New York

Exhibit "1"
Exhibit "2"
Before recitation of the paragraph "Pour out Thy wrath," and Hallel and the Great Hallel ("O give thanks unto the Lord"), let us turn to two great epochs of our time:

1) Chaos and destruction—"for they have devoured Jacob and laid waste his dwelling place."

2) Liberation and rebuilding—"Who rememberest us in our low estate; for His lovingkindness endureth forever. And hath released us from our adversaries . . ."

We, members of the most unfortunate generation in all the years of Israel's exile, with our own eyes have beheld the annihilation of one third of our people at the hands of the savage Nazis and their accomplices in other nations. When we recite "Pour out Thy wrath," we are reminded of "the nations that know Thee not." And when we recite "To Him Who alone doeth great marvels," we recall the miraculous events accorded us by the Eternal in our own days and our own Holy Land; for this is the beginning of the redemption of people and soil, and the gathering of the exiles.

By saying the Great Hallel [it being considered a highly praiseworthy act to recite it over a fifth cup, as legislated and approved by many early sages, including the Maharal of Prague, in testimony to the passage, "And I will bring you in unto the land concerning which I lifted up My hand to give it to Abraham, to Isaac, and to Jacob"], we give thanks to God, and pray that we be enabled to behold all His children speedily and happily gathered in our own days within the boundaries of the Land of Israel.